

Message

**From:** Ross, Mary [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=98359CD1F66F46EC91D327E99A3C6909-ROSS, MARY]  
**Sent:** 11/17/2016 1:52:52 AM  
**To:** Deener, Kathleen [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b9a2ff1c086249ea8f6414afde8a5e54-Deener, Kathleen]; Vandenberg, John [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dcae2b98a04540fb8d099f9d4dead690-Vandenberg, John]; Gwinn, Maureen [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4bdc5237a5c440a7b664518e23eb5647-Gwinn, Maureen]; Cogliano, Vincent [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=51f2736376ac4d32bad2fe7cfef2886b-Cogliano, Vincent]; Thomas, Russell [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=12f119e7a3ee447499f3d6ab5d20daeb-Thomas, Rus]; Bahadori, Tina [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7da7967dcafb4c5bbc39c666fee31ec3-Bahadori, Tina]; Burke, Thomas [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=39ffc3dd34ea495b9a31e61b778fbbec-Burke, Thom]; Slimak, Michael [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=197d6551afaf4d90b087c4d5bf62b53c-Slimak, Mike]; Flowers, Lynn [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1a4411c874d041b9a8badfc32b91bd70-Flowers, Lynn]; Kavlock, Robert [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=eebac67f01094409a7fdaa955a837884-Kavlock, Robert]  
**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting - some edits to text and case study  
**Attachments:** Case Study Table\_11.16.16 MR.docx

Hi everyone. Sorry to come in late. **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**  
Just looked at it and I see you did it already, thanks.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

**From:** Deener, Kathleen  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 16, 2016 12:46 PM  
**To:** Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Gwinn, Maureen <gwinn.maureen@epa.gov>; Cogliano, Vincent <cogliano.vincent@epa.gov>; Thomas, Russell <Thomas.Russell@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Burke, Thomas <Burke.Thomas@epa.gov>; Slimak, Michael <Slimak.Michael@epa.gov>; Flowers, Lynn <Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov>; Ross, Mary <Ross.Mary@epa.gov>; Kavlock, Robert <Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting - some edits to text and case study

Thanks John.

I've attached updated versions of the materials. I've also added two items to the agenda:

- **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Kacee Deener, MPH  
Senior Science Advisor  
Office of Research and Development  
(ph) 202.564.1990 | (mobile) [deener.kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:deener.kathleen@epa.gov)

Personal Matters / Ex. 6

**From:** Vandenberg, John

**Sent:** Tuesday, November 15, 2016 11:26 PM

**To:** Deener, Kathleen <[Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov)>; Gwinn, Maureen <[gwinn.maureen@epa.gov](mailto:gwinn.maureen@epa.gov)>; Cogliano, Vincent <[cogliano.vincent@epa.gov](mailto:cogliano.vincent@epa.gov)>; Thomas, Russell <[Thomas.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Thomas.Russell@epa.gov)>; Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>; Burke, Thomas <[Burke.Thomas@epa.gov](mailto:Burke.Thomas@epa.gov)>; Slimak, Michael <[Slimak.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Slimak.Michael@epa.gov)>; Flowers, Lynn <[Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov](mailto:Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov)>; Ross, Mary <[Ross.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Ross.Mary@epa.gov)>; Kavlock, Robert <[Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting - some edits to text and case study

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I also have a few edits and comments on the text.

I've been traveling overseas and trying to dig out – sorry for late revisions.  
John

**From:** Deener, Kathleen

**Sent:** Tuesday, November 15, 2016 8:48 AM

**To:** Gwinn, Maureen <[gwinn.maureen@epa.gov](mailto:gwinn.maureen@epa.gov)>; Cogliano, Vincent <[cogliano.vincent@epa.gov](mailto:cogliano.vincent@epa.gov)>; Thomas, Russell <[Thomas.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Thomas.Russell@epa.gov)>; Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>; Burke, Thomas <[Burke.Thomas@epa.gov](mailto:Burke.Thomas@epa.gov)>; Slimak, Michael <[Slimak.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Slimak.Michael@epa.gov)>; Flowers, Lynn <[Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov](mailto:Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov)>; Ross, Mary <[Ross.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Ross.Mary@epa.gov)>; Kavlock, Robert <[Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting

Hi All –

Thanks for your review and comments/edits! I've attached the final (??) versions of all of the documents.

In the case study table, Rusty posed a question about the screening example we provided. He noted that ultimately a 28 day study was found for MCHM and wonders if that diminishes the strength of this example. An alternative example to consider is the gulf oil spill dispersants. Please think about that between now and Thursday. If we want to replace the MCHM example, I will need a volunteer to write up the dispersant example.

For Thursday's meeting, let's plan on the following agenda:

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

## : Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Let me know if there are other agenda items I should add.

Thanks again for the great comments and edits!

Kacee Deener, MPH  
Senior Science Advisor  
Office of Research and Development  
(ph) 202.564.1990 | (mobile) [Personal Matters / Ex. 6](#)  
[deener.kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:deener.kathleen@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Gwinn, Maureen  
**Sent:** Monday, November 14, 2016 5:01 PM  
**To:** Cogliano, Vincent <[cogliano.vincent@epa.gov](mailto:cogliano.vincent@epa.gov)>; Thomas, Russell <[Thomas.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Thomas.Russell@epa.gov)>; Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>; Deener, Kathleen <[Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov)>; Burke, Thomas <[Burke.Thomas@epa.gov](mailto:Burke.Thomas@epa.gov)>; Slimak, Michael <[Slimak.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Slimak.Michael@epa.gov)>; Flowers, Lynn <[Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov](mailto:Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov)>; Ross, Mary <[Ross.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Ross.Mary@epa.gov)>; Kavlock, Robert <[Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting

Added my proposed edits to the same file.

Sorry so late!

No further comments on the table from me.

Maureen

Maureen R. Gwinn, PhD DABT ATS  
Science Associate/IOAA

t(202)564-4621  
m [Personal Matters / Ex. 6](#)

---

**From:** Cogliano, Vincent  
**Sent:** Monday, November 14, 2016 4:45 PM  
**To:** Thomas, Russell <[Thomas.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Thomas.Russell@epa.gov)>; Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>; Deener, Kathleen <[Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov)>; Burke, Thomas <[Burke.Thomas@epa.gov](mailto:Burke.Thomas@epa.gov)>; Slimak, Michael <[Slimak.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Slimak.Michael@epa.gov)>; Flowers, Lynn <[Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov](mailto:Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov)>; Ross, Mary <[Ross.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Ross.Mary@epa.gov)>; Kavlock, Robert <[Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov)>; Gwinn, Maureen <[gwinn.maureen@epa.gov](mailto:gwinn.maureen@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting

Hello everyone—Looking better! A few more comments from me ... I'll miss this week's meeting. We have a kick-off teleconference with the SAB/CAAC on our RDX assessment that afternoon—Vince

---

**From:** Thomas, Russell  
**Sent:** Sunday, November 13, 2016 11:01 PM  
**To:** Bahadori, Tina <[Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov](mailto:Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov)>; Deener, Kathleen <[Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov)>; Burke, Thomas <[Burke.Thomas@epa.gov](mailto:Burke.Thomas@epa.gov)>; Cogliano, Vincent <[cogliano.vincent@epa.gov](mailto:cogliano.vincent@epa.gov)>; Slimak, Michael <[Slimak.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Slimak.Michael@epa.gov)>; Flowers, Lynn <[Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov](mailto:Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov)>; Ross, Mary <[Ross.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Ross.Mary@epa.gov)>; Kavlock,

Robert <[Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov)>; Gwinn, Maureen <[gwinn.maureen@epa.gov](mailto:gwinn.maureen@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting

My edits added.

Rusty

---

**From:** Bahadori, Tina

**Sent:** Sunday, November 13, 2016 5:40 PM

**To:** Deener, Kathleen <[Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:Deener.Kathleen@epa.gov)>; Burke, Thomas <[Burke.Thomas@epa.gov](mailto:Burke.Thomas@epa.gov)>; Cogliano, Vincent <[cogliano.vincent@epa.gov](mailto:cogliano.vincent@epa.gov)>; Slimak, Michael <[Slimak.Michael@epa.gov](mailto:Slimak.Michael@epa.gov)>; Thomas, Russell <[Thomas.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Thomas.Russell@epa.gov)>; Flowers, Lynn <[Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov](mailto:Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov)>; Ross, Mary <[Ross.Mary@epa.gov](mailto:Ross.Mary@epa.gov)>; Kavlock, Robert <[Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov](mailto:Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov)>; Gwinn, Maureen <[gwinn.maureen@epa.gov](mailto:gwinn.maureen@epa.gov)>; Vandenberg, John <[Vandenberg.John@epa.gov](mailto:Vandenberg.John@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting

Hi Kacee,

It's exciting to see this come to fruition! Thanks for patiently nursing and shepherding it.

- 
- 
- 
- 

# Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks!

Tina

=====

**Lisa Chong, Deputy Editor, Insights**

As the Deputy Editor of *Science's* Insights, Lisa D. Chong oversees Editorials, Perspectives, Policy Forums, Letters, and Books sections. She joined Science in 1998 and handled research in the biological sciences as an Associate and Senior Editor. Lisa received a bachelor's degree from Cornell University in and doctoral degree from Yale University in cell biology in 1993. She did postdoctoral work in La Jolla, Ca. at The Scripps Research Institute and the Burnham Institute, and also at the National Institutes of Health, where her studies spanned signal transduction, cell migration, and neuronal development. In addition to research discoveries, Lisa is also interested in science communication and the interface between science and culture.

---

**From:** Deener, Kathleen  
**Sent:** Monday, November 07, 2016 4:42 PM  
**To:** Burke, Thomas <Burke.Thomas@epa.gov>; Cogliano, Vincent <cogliano.vincent@epa.gov>; Slimak, Michael <Slimak.Michael@epa.gov>; Thomas, Russell <Thomas.Russell@epa.gov>; Flowers, Lynn <Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov>; Ross, Mary <Ross.Mary@epa.gov>; Kavlock, Robert <Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Gwinn, Maureen <gwinn.maureen@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting

Hi All —

Just a reminder to please review the attached revised document and send your comments to this group by COB November 10.

I've also attached a case study table for your review and input. Please send any comments or edits to the group by Nov. 15.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks!

Kacee Deener, MPH  
Senior Science Advisor  
Office of Research and Development  
(ph) 202.564.1990 | **Personal Phone / Ex. 6**  
[deener.kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:deener.kathleen@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Deener, Kathleen  
**Sent:** Thursday, November 03, 2016 6:01 PM  
**To:** Burke, Thomas <Burke.Thomas@epa.gov>; Cogliano, Vincent <cogliano.vincent@epa.gov>; Slimak, Michael <Slimak.Michael@epa.gov>; Thomas, Russell <Thomas.Russell@epa.gov>; Flowers, Lynn <Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov>; Ross, Mary <Ross.Mary@epa.gov>; Kavlock, Robert <Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Gwinn, Maureen <gwinn.maureen@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Innovations In Chemical Risk Assessment Weekly Meeting

Hi All — thanks for a great meeting today!

I've attached a slightly updated version of the document. I hope this reflects today's conversation. I've canceled next week's meeting, so we will meet again on November 17. Below are the next steps for this group.

### Next Steps

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.

## Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks!

Kacee Deener, MPH  
Senior Science Advisor  
Office of Research and Development  
(ph) 202.564.1990 | Personal Phone / Ex. 6  
[deener.kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:deener.kathleen@epa.gov)